



**PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT
ON
IMPROVEMENT IN SERVICE DELIVERY
DUE TO MERIT BASED/SCHOOL BASED
RECRUITMENT POLICY FOR
TEACHING CADRE IN EDUCATION
DEPARTMENT IN DISTRICT
DERA ISMAIL KHAN**

AUDIT YEAR 2019-20

AUDITOR GENERAL OF PAKISTAN

PREFACE

The Auditor General of Pakistan conducts audit in accordance with Articles 169 and 170 of the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973, read with Sections 8 and 12 of the Auditor General's (Functions, Powers and Terms and Conditions of Service) Ordinance 2001. The Performance Audit on "Improvement in service delivery due to merit based/school based recruitment policy for teaching cadre in Education Department D.I.Khan" was carried out accordingly.

The Directorate General Audit, District Governments, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa conducted performance audit on "Improvement in service delivery due to merit based/school based recruitment policy for teaching cadre in Education Department D.I.Khan" for the period from 2014-15 to 2018-19 during January 2020 with a view to report significant findings to stakeholders. Audit examined the economy, efficiency and effectiveness aspects of the recruitment of teaching staff through NTS. Audit also assessed, on test check basis, whether the management complied with the applicable laws, rules and regulations during recruitment of teaching staff. The Audit report indicates specific actions that, if taken, will help the management to realize the objectives of recruitment policy.

Most of the observations included in this report have been finalized in the light of written responses and discussions with the management. DAC meeting could not be arranged besides frequent reminder.

The Audit Report is submitted to the Governor of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa in pursuance of Article 171 of the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan 1973, for causing it to be laid before the Provincial Assembly of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

Islamabad
Dated:

(Javaid Jehangir)
Auditor General of Pakistan

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	i
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	ii
1. INTRODUCTION.....	1
2. AUDIT OBJECTIVES	2
4. AUDIT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	4
4.1 Organization & Management	4
4.2 Financial Management	10
4.3 Monitoring & Evaluation	12
4.4 Overall Assessment	16
5. Conclusion.....	18
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	19
RESPONSE AND IMPLEMENTATION OF RECOMMENDATIONS.....	20
ANNEXURES.....	22

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

ADEO	Assistant District Education Officer
ASDEO	Assistant Sub-Divisional Education Officer
CT	Certified Teacher
DAC	Departmental Accounts Committee
DEO	District Education Officer
DM	Drawing Master
D.I.Khan	Dera Ismail Khan
E&SE	Elementary & Secondary Education
GPS	Government Primary School
GGPS	Government Girls Primary School
INTOSAI	International Organization of Supreme Audit Institutions
KP	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
NAB	National Accountability Bureau
NTS	National Testing Service
PC-I	Planning Commission-I
PET	Physical Education Teacher
PITE	Provincial Institute of Teachers Education
PST	Primary School Teacher
RITE	Regional Institute of Teachers Education
S&GAD	Services & General Administration Department
TORs	Terms of Reference

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Directorate General Audit, District Governments, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa conducted performance audit titled “Improvement in service delivery due to merit /school based recruitment policy for teaching cadre in District Education Department D.I.Khan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa” during January, 2020. The main objectives of audit were to evaluate the role of newly appointed merit/school based system of economy, efficiency and effectiveness. The audit was conducted in accordance with INTOSAI Auditing Standards as adopted by the Department of the Auditor General of Pakistan.

The process of recruitment of teachers on Adhoc/Contract basis within cluster of schools in Elementary and Secondary Education Department was initiated in 2014 in compliance to the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (Appointment, Deputation, Posting and Transfer of Teachers, lecturers, Instructors and Doctors) Regulatory Act, 2011. It stipulates that vacancy of primary school teacher shall be filled in from the candidates belonging to the Union Council of their permanent residence mentioned in their Computerized National Identity Card and domicile, on merit and if no eligible candidate in that Union Council is available where the school is situated, such appointment shall be made on merit from amongst eligible candidates belonging to the adjacent Union Councils. The teachers were hired through National Testing Service with the basic aim to end the shortage of teachers and speeding up the recruitment process, which otherwise took a long time when carried out through Public Service Commission. From 2014 till 2019, Elementary and Secondary Education department recruited around 40,000 teachers on adhoc/contract basis through merit/school based recruitment policy from the parent union council or adjacent union council. However, during election year 2018, the services of the adhoc teachers were regularized under the “The Khyber Pakhtunkhwa employees of the Elementary & Secondary Education Department (Appointment and Regularization of Services) Act, 2017”.

Key Audit Findings

Key Audit Findings are as follows:

- i. Illegal and irregular appointment of school teachers without observing codal formalities.(Para 4.1.1)
- ii. The school teachers were selected without conducting interview of candidates.(Para 4.1.2)
- iii. The school teachers were recruited without adopting school based recruitment policy. .(Para 4.1.3)
- iv. Non- professional candidates were appointed in teaching cadre. .(Para 4.1.4)
- v. Education department has not conducted anyprofessional training program for un-trained teachers. .(Para 4.1.5)
- vi. A large no of posts are lying vacant in teaching cadre in the District. .(Para 4.1.6)
- vii. The training institutes have conducted no trainings during last two years but expenditure was incurred by these institutes. .(Para 4.2.1)
- viii. The random survey and sampling shows poor quality of education in District D.I.Khan .(Para 4.3.1)
- ix. The strength of student's enrollment ratio has decreased in last three years. (Para 4.3.2)
- x. There were no key performance indicators for teaching staff. .(Para 4.3.3)
- xi. The rationalization policy was not implemented by the department. .(Para 4.3.4)

Recommendations

Education Department D.I.Khanneeds to be:

- i. The appointments of teachers were made without observing codal formalities and merit list which needs action against the person (s) at fault.
- ii. Interview marks may include in the selection process of the school/merit based teachers.
- iii. Merit based/ school based recruitment policy to over-come the shortage of professional teachers on need basis is required to be adopted.
- iv. Non-professional and un-trained teachers were recruited and no training program was introduced which needs proper justification.

- v. Department needs to expedite efforts to start training programs without any further delay.
- vi. As a large no of posts is still lying vacant in spite of school / merit based recruitment which needs to be expedite the matter.
- vii. Professional training is the essential element for improving the capacity building of the in service teachers hence department needs efforts to start training programs without further delay.
- viii. The quality of education is poor at primary level as the most of the students unable to read and write the paragraphs of syllabus which needs efforts, monitoring and control.
- ix. As the enrollment of students reduced in spite of school / merit based recruitment hence department needs more monitoring and control.
- x. Key performance indicators for teaching staff are required to be set by department.
- xi. Management needs to implement rationalization policy during posting of teachers in the schools.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

The Director General Audit, District Government, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa conducted performance audit on “Improvement in service delivery due to merit based/school based recruitment policy for teaching cadre in Education Department D.I.Khan” during January, 2020. The main objective of audit was to evaluate the impact of merit based/school based recruitment policy in education department. The audit was conducted in accordance with INTOSAI Auditing Standards as adopted by the Department of the Auditor General of Pakistan.

Article 25-A of Constitution of Pakistan stipulates “The State shall provide free and compulsory education to all children of the age of five to sixteen years in such a manner as may be determined by law” which makes it obligatory on the State to provide free and compulsory quality education to children of the age group 5 to 16 years. Subject of Elementary and Secondary Education is devolved to Districts/Tehsils as mentioned in the list of devolved offices of First Schedule of Local Government (amendment) bill, 2019, which makes it binding on the District Education Offices to implement policies and procedures of E&SE Department of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa as devised under constitutional obligations. Over the last 5 years, Provincial Government had reformed the terms and conditions of teachers, which also included recruitment rules, with the intention to shape the entire teacher performance environment. It was believed that robust and mutually beneficial terms and conditions for teachers could encourage good candidates to enter the profession, and could reward merit throughout a teachers’ career, ultimately resulting in improved teaching standards and enhanced student learning outcomes. Under this backdrop, merit (NTS) and school based recruitment policy was introduced and teaching cadre up to BPS-15 were recruited through District Education Offices in each district. This policy and results thereafter need to be scrutinized to assess that whether such results were achieved.

1.2 Organizational Structure

District Education Office (Male & Female) D.I.Khan is headed by District Education Officer. District Education Officer is assisted by Deputy District Education Officer and Sub-Division Education Officer. DDEO is further assisted by ADEO establishment, ADEO P&D and ADEO Sports while ASDEO is assisted by ASDEOs circle.

2. AUDIT OBJECTIVES

The major objectives of the audit were to ascertain whether the:

- Level of observance of recruitment policy during recruitment process was sound.
- Improvement in service delivery due to merit based/school based recruitment policy in education department through NTS was achieved.
- Criteria set for recruitment of teachers up to BPS-15 was complied with or not.
- Rationalization policy of teachers for ascertaining demand of teachers in the public schools was executed.
- Improvement in the learning landmarks of students during various assessment exercises held at various grades through internal and external organizations was achieved.

3. AUDIT SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

Audit Scope

Audit focused on role and efforts made by District Education Officer (Male &Female) D.I.Khan for improvement in service delivery due to merit based/school based recruitment policy in education department through NTS w.e.f., 2014 to 2019.

Documents Review

Documents were reviewed to gain an understanding of the impact of recruitment policy of education department on overall education progress. Some of the documents reviewed were;

- Recruitment policy
- Rationalization policy
- Annual school census reports
- EMIS/IMU Data
- Reconciled expenditure statements
- Districts Performance Scorecards

Audit Methodology

The audit was conducted in accordance with International Organization of Supreme Audit Institutions (INTOSAI) Auditing Standards as adopted by the Department of the Auditor General of Pakistan. These standards require comprehensive planning to ensure that an audit of high quality is carried out in an economic, efficient and effective way within the planned time and cost. Data was collected from both primary and secondary sources.

The District Education Officers (Male & Female) D.I.Khan was visited by the audit team to gather information through interviews from the management of the department and to review the documents and other related records. Information was also collected from the websites of Independent Monitoring Unit (IMU), Education Management Information System (EMIS) and Elementary and Secondary Education Department Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Moreover, statistical reports of the government schools as carried out the department from 2014 till date were also consulted to have better understanding of the reforms introduced by the government from time to time.

4. AUDIT FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

4.1 Organization & Management

4.1.1 Illegal and irregular appointment of teachers without observing codal formalities.

As per S.No.9 (a) of Part I of District Govt Rules of Business 2015, a District Officer shall be responsible for observance of laws, rules and bye-laws, efficient conduct of business, administration and financial discipline in the office.

During Performance Audit of “Improvement in service delivery due to merit / school based recruitment policy in District Education Offices (Male & Female) in the District D.I.Khan, it was observed that the District Education Officer (Female) D.I.Khan recruited twenty two female school teachers without observing codal formalities and merit list issued by National Testing Service (NTS) during 2014-15 and an inquiry was conducted by a committee constituted by Elementary & Secondary Education department and recommended disciplinary action against the person (s) at fault but no progress was made in this regard by the competent authority (Detail in Annex-1).

Audit observed that illegal recruitments occurred due to weak internal control which resulted into poor performance of education system towards service delivery in quality education.

When pointed out in February, 2020, the management replied that the case is forwarded by Education Department to National Accountability Bureau (NAB) KP for appropriate action against the officers / officials at fault. However no progress was made besides lapse of several years in this regard.

Request for arranging DAC meeting was made on 05-03-2020. DAC meeting could not be convened till finalization of report.

As the appointments of teachers were made without observing codal formalities and merit list which needs action against the person (s) at fault.

4.1.2 Selection of teachers without conducting interview of candidates.

According to Establishment Department's Khyber Pakhtunkhwa circular letter No.SOR-I(S&GAD) 4-1/75, dated 26.5 2000, that candidates qualifying the written test for posts in BPS-5 & above upto 08 marks will be added on the basis of interview.

District Education Officers (Male & Female) D.I.Khan recruited school teachers on the basis of merit list issued by National Testing Service on formula of written test marks plus qualification while the marks of interview were not included in selection process.

Audit holds that selection of suitable person for teaching position without personnel interview by panel of experts may lead to appointment of incompetent candidates.

When pointed out in February, 2020, the management replied that interview is essential part of recruitment, if it is conducted fairly. Demerit of interview is like/dislikes and chances of nepotism cannot be ignored. Reply of the department was not convincing as without proper interview selection of suitable candidates is not possible.

Request for arranging DAC meeting was made on 05-03-2020. DAC meeting could not be convened till finalization of report.

Audit recommends inclusion interview marks in the selection process of the school/merit based teachers.

4.1.3 Non adoption of school based recruitment Policy.

As per S.No.10 (xviii) of Second Schedule of District Govt Rules of Business 2015, a District Officer shall ensure to promote literacy in the District. Moreover as per Govt of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Elementary & Secondary Education Department Notification No.SO (PE) 4-

5/SSRC/Meeting/2012/Teaching Cadre/2017 dated 30-01-2018, no professional courses are required for appointment of school teachers in Education Department.

During Performance Audit of “Improvement in service delivery due to merit based/ school based recruitment policy in District Education Offices (Male & Female) in the District D.I.Khan, it was observed that the recruitment was made on school /merit based system upto December 2017 by mentioning schools by candidates but after that the policy of recruitment of non-professional school teachers with-out mentioning schools was adopted which violates the objective to appoint professional teachers in specific school on need basis to promote the literacy in the District.

Audit observed that non-adopting of school based recruitment policy occurred due to weak internal control which may leads towards poor performance service delivery of Education Department.

When pointed out in February, 2020, the management replied that the recruitment of non-professional and untrained teachers without mentioning schools at the time of recruitment process was made according to policy issued by the Elementary & Secondary Education Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

Request for arranging DAC meeting was made on 05-03-2020. DAC meeting could not be convened till finalization of report.

As the merit based/ school based recruitment policy to over-come the shortage of professional teachers on need basis was not adopted which needs proper justification.

4.1.4 Recruitment of non- professional candidates in teaching cadre.

As per S.No.9 (a) of Part I of District Govt Rules of Business 2015, a District Officer shall be responsible for observance of laws, rules and bye-laws, efficient conduct of business, administration and financial discipline in the office. Moreover as per S.No.10 (xviii) of Second Schedule of District Govt Rules

of Business 2015, a District Officer shall ensure to promote literacy in the District.

During performance Audit of “Improvement in service delivery due to merit / school based recruitment policy in District Education Offices (Male & Female) in District D.I.Khan, it was observed that the recruitment was made on school / merit based system upto December 2017 with the condition of candidates having Professional Qualification i.e PTC, CT, etc but after that no such criteria was followed by the department.

Audit observed that recruitment of untrained teachers occurred due to defective policy which may leads towards poor performance of Education Department.

When pointed out in February, 2020, the management replied that the recruitment of non-professional and untrained teachers at the time of recruitment process was made according to policy issued by the Elementary & Secondary Education Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

Request for arranging DAC meeting was made on 05-03-2020. DAC meeting could not be convened till finalization of report.

As the non-professional and un-trained teachers were recruited and no training program was introduced till the finalization of this report hence matter needs proper justification.

4.1.5 Non-conducting of professional training for un-trained teachers.

As per S.No.10 (vi) of Second Schedule of District Govt Rules of Business 2015, a District Officer shall arrange teachers training and evaluation of their performance.

During Performance Audit of “Improvement in service delivery due to merit based/ school based recruitment policy in District Education Offices (Male

& Female) in the District D.I.Khan, it was observed that the District Education Officer D.I.Khan has neither planned nor conducted any professional training program for in-service government schools teachers for enhancing their professional capacity building during last three years w.e.f 2017 to 2019.

Audit observed that non-conducting of professional training programs occurred due to weak internal control which resulted into poor performance in delivery services by Education Department.

When pointed out in February, 2020, the management replied that the Education Department is planning to arrange the trainings of non-professionals and untrained schools teachers in Regional Institute of Teachers Education (RITE).

Request for arranging DAC meeting was made on 05-03-2020. DAC meeting could not be convened till finalization of report.

As the professional training is the essential element for improving the capacity building of the in service teachers hence department needs efforts to start training programs without further delay.

4.1.6 Non filling of vacant posts of teaching cadre in district.

As per S.No.9 (c & d) of Part I of District Govt Rules of Business 2015, a District Officer shall ensure that all the human and material resources placed at his disposal are optimally utilized to improve Government and coordinate and supervise to ensure efficient service delivery by functionary under his administrative control.

During Performance Audit of “Improvement in service delivery due to merit based/ school based recruitment policy in District Education Offices (Male & Female) in the District D.I.Khan, it was observed that as per record of last two years data (2018 to 2019) a large number of post of all teaching cadre were lying vacant in boys and girls schools of District D.I.Khan as detailed below:

S #	Year	No of sanctioned post of male teaching staff	No. of in service male teacher	No of Vacant posts
i.	2018	5944	5407	537
ii.	2019	5999	5394	605

S #	Year	No of sanctioned post of Female teaching staff	No. of in service Female teacher	No of Vacant posts
i.	2018	3606	2994	576
ii.	2019	3648	3246	402

Audit observed that non filling of vacant posts may occur due to weak internal controls which result into poor performance towards imparting quality education in the District.

When pointed out in February, 2020, the management replied that the Education Department is trying level best to fill the vacant posts in Govt schools of District.

Request for arranging DAC meeting was made on 05-03-2020. DAC meeting could not be convened till finalization of report.

As a large no of posts is still laying vacant in-spite of school / merit based recruitment. Hence efforts need to expedite the case

4.2 Financial Management

4.2.1 Wasteful expenditure on training institutes -Rs. 60.783 million.

As per S.No.10 (VI) of Second Schedule of District Govt Rules of Business 2015, a District Officer shall arrange teachers training and evaluation of their performance.

As per Govt of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Elementary & Secondary Education Department Notification No.SO (PE) 4-5/SSRC/Meeting/2012/Teaching Cadre/2017 dated 30-01-2018, the professional training will be given to the newly recruited teachers under induction program in Govt training institutes.

During Performance Audit of “Improvement in service delivery due to merit based/ school based recruitment policy in District Education Offices (Male & Female) in the District D.I.Khan, it was observed that the Education Department KP adopted the policy of recruitment of non-professionals candidates without any requirement of professional courses i.e CT, PTC, DM etc from Regional Institute of Teachers Education (RITE) after December 2017, due to which no training programs were conducted since June 2017 while expenditure were continuously incurred by these institutes, as detailed below;

S.No	Year	Expenditure of RITE (Male) (Rs)	Expenditure of RITE (Female) (Rs)	Total (Rs)
i	2017-18	17,770,664	16,162,322	33,932,986
ii	2018-19	16,681,833	10,168,650	26,850,483
Grand Total		34,452,497	26,330,972	60,783,469

Audit observed that wasteful expenditure occurred due to change in recruitment policy by the Government which resulted into loss to Government.

When pointed out in February, 2020, the management replied that the Education Department is planning to arrange the trainings of non-professionals and untrained schools teachers in Regional Institute of Teachers Education (RITE).

Request for arranging DAC meeting was made on 05-03-2020. DAC meeting could not be convened till finalization of report.

As the professional training is the essential element for improving the capacity building of the in service teachers hence department needs efforts to start training programs without further delay.

4.3 Monitoring & Evaluation

4.3.1 Poor quality of education in District D.I.Khan

As per S.No.10 (xiv &xviii) of Second Schedule of District Govt Rules of Business 2015, a District Officer shall conduct academic inspections and supervision of schools and ensure to promote literacy in the District.

During Performance Audit of “Improvement in service delivery due to merit based/ school based recruitment policy in District Education Offices (Male & Female) in the District D.I.Khan, it was observed that a data collected from 20 primary schools (10 boys and 10 girls) students form Class-I to IV, the 45% students unable to read and write a story in Urdu and 63% students were unable to read a sentence in English, 35% students unable to solve the mathematical questions (Detail in Annex-2).

Audit observed that poor quality of education occurred due to weak monitoring and control by the education department.

When pointed out in February, 2020, the management replied that the Education Department is trying level best to improve the quality of education in Govt schools of District D.I.Khan.

Request for arranging DAC meeting was made on 05-03-2020. DAC meeting could not be convened till finalization of report.

As the most of the students were unable to read and write the paragraphs included in syllabus hence department needs more monitoring and control.

4.3.2 Downfall in the student’s enrollment ratio

As per S.No.9 (c & d) of Part I of District Govt Rules of Business 2015, a District Officer shall ensure that all the human and material resources placed at his disposal are optimally utilized to improve Government and coordinate and

supervise to ensure efficient service delivery by functionary under his administrative control.

During Performance Audit of “Improvement in service delivery due to merit based/ school based recruitment policy in District Education Offices (Male & Female) in the District D.I.Khan, it was observed that in-spite of school / merit based recruitment policy , the average enrollment ratio of students in Boys and Girls schools dropped which lead towards poor performance (detail in annex-3).

Audit observed that fall down in enrollment average occurred due to weak internal control which may result into poor performance.

When pointed out in February, 2020, the management replied that the Education Department is trying level best to increase enrollment in Govt schools of District.

Request for arranging DAC meeting was made on 05-03-2020. DAC meeting could not be convened till finalization of report.

As the enrollment of students reduced in-spite of school / merit based recruitment hence department needs more monitoring and control.

4.3.3 Non-existence of key performance indicators for teaching staff.

As per S.No.10 (xviii) of Second Schedule of District Govt Rules of Business 2015, a District Officer shall ensure to promote literacy in the District.

As per S.No.9 (c & d) of Part I of District Govt Rules of Business 2015, a District Officer shall ensure that all the human and material resources placed at his disposal are optimally utilized to improve Government and coordinate and supervise to ensure efficient service delivery by functionary under his administrative control.

During Performance Audit of “Improvement in service delivery due to merit based/school based recruitment policy for teaching cadre in District Education Offices (Male & Female) D.I.Khan” it was observed that the authorities failed to set key performance indicators for newly recruited teachers.

Non-existence of key performance indicators occurred due to weak internal controls resulting poor performance in service delivery in education sector.

When pointed out in February, 2020, the management replied that the department is agreed with the audit observation and working will be made on setting key performance indicator. However, without setting key performance indicators for newly appointed teachers the management remains unaware about performance of school teachers.

Request for arranging DAC meeting was made on 05-03-2020. DAC meeting could not be convened till finalization of report.

Audit recommends setting of key performance indicators for teaching staff.

4.3.4 Non implementation of rationalization policy.

According to Director Elementary & Secondary Education Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Notification No.6014-50/Rationalization/EST/ dated 01/04/2014, in primary schools the teacher/students ration shall be 1:40.

During Performance Audit of “Improvement in service delivery due to merit based/school based recruitment policy for teaching cadre in District Education Offices (Male & Female) D.I.Khan”, it was observed that teacher’s rationalization policy was not adopted while posting of teachers and many schools were short of teachers in various schools on sample basis data of schools was analyzed. (Details given in Annex-4)

Rationalization of teachers was not followed due to giving undue favors to teaching staff resulting poor performance due to shortage of teachers in respective schools.

When pointed out in February, 2020, the management replied that the rationalization policy implemented partially and remaining schools will be implemented soon. Reply of the department was not convincing as due to non-implementation of rationalization policy in letter and spirit students were suffered.

Request for arranging DAC meeting was made on 05-03-2020. DAC meeting could not be convened till finalization of report.

Audit recommends implementation of rationalization policy while posting of teachers and action against the person(s) at fault.

4.4 Overall Assessment

The policy of recruitment of school/merit based Adhoc teachers' requirement was introduced by the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa in 2014 with the aim to Improvement in service delivery. Later on the services of the Adhoc teachers were regularized. The overall assessment shows satisfactory performance in service delivery due to merit based/school based recruitment policy for teaching cadre as there is no closed / ghost school in the District and shortage of teachers also over come through merit based recruitment policy.

The objective criteria for rating the overall policy of the Education Department for imparting quality education are as under:-

- i. Relevance:** The overall recruitment process of school/merit based teachers was in line with the Government policy.
- ii. Efficacy:** The Education department achieved the basic objectives and purposes to overcome the shortage of teachers especially in remote areas of the District D.I.Khan by adopting merit based recruitment policy.
- iii. Efficiency:** School/merit based policy was adopted to overcome the shortage of staff with in appropriate budget provision and given time line in more efficient manners.
- iv. Economy:** The recruitment was made through transparent and merit based system by selecting qualified and competent teachers.
- v. Effectiveness:** The overall performance was satisfactory and targets have been successfully achieved.
- vi. Compliance with rules & regulations:** In most of the cases the rules and regulations were followed as per policy of Govt of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. However during 2014-15, the DEO (F) D.I.Khan appointed several female teachers without observing codal formalities.

vii. Performance rating:The overall performance of the Education Department regarding Improvement in service delivery due to merit based/school based recruitment policy for teaching cadre in District Education Offices (Male & Female) D.I.Khan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa”,was satisfactory.

viii. Risk rating: The risk rating of the Education Department regarding Improvement in service delivery due to merit based/school based recruitment policy for teaching cadre in District Education Offices (Male & Female) D.I.Khan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa”,was low.

5. CONCLUSION

The overall conclusion of performance audit of the “Improvement in service delivery due to merit based/school based recruitment policy for teaching cadre in District Education Offices (Male & Female) D.I.Khan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa” is as under:

5.1 Key issues for future: The main issue hampered the performance of improvement in service delivery due to merit based/school based recruitment policy for teaching cadre was to obsolete of recruitment of non-professional teachers without mentioning schools which may not overcome the shortage of professional teaching staff in remote areas of the District.

5.2 Lessons identified: In view of the foregoing paras on performance audit of the “Improvement in service delivery due to merit based/school based recruitment policy for teaching cadre in District Education Offices (Male & Female) D.I.Khan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa”, it may be concluded that a significant improvement in service delivery due to merit based/school based recruitment policy for teaching cadre in District Education Offices (Male & Female) D.I.Khan was made. However it requires introduction of technology and personalize the learning experience to meet the needs of each individual student.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

We wish to express our appreciation to the management and staff of District Education Offices (Male & Female) D.I.Khan and District Monitoring Officer (IMU) D.I.Khan for the assistance and cooperation with the auditors during this assignment.

RESPONSE AND IMPLEMENTATION OF RECOMMENDATIONS

Para No	Recommendations	Accepted Yes/No	Implementation date	Client Comments
1	As the appointments of teachers were made without observing codal formalities and merit list which needs action against the person (s) at fault.	Yes	Nil	The case is forwarded by Education Department to National Accountability Bureau (NAB) KP for appropriate action against the officers / officials at fault.
2	Inclusion interview marks in the selection process of the school/merit based teachers.	Yes	Nil	Interview is essential part of recruitment, if it is conducted fairly. Demerit of interview is like/dislikes and chances of nepotism cannot be ignored.
3	As the merit based/ school based recruitment policy to over-come the shortage of professional teachers on need basis was not adopted which needs proper justification.	Yes	Nil	The recruitment of non-professional and untrained teachers without mentioning schools at the time of recruitment process was made according to policy issued by the Elementary & Secondary Education Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
4	As the non-professional and un-trained teachers were recruited and no training program was introduced till the finalization of this report hence matter needs proper justification.	Yes	Nil	The recruitment of non-professional and untrained teachers at the time of recruitment process was made according to policy issued by the Elementary & Secondary Education Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.
5	As the professional training is the essential element for improving the capacity building of the in service teachers hence department needs efforts to start training programs without further delay.	Yes	Nil	The Education Department is planning to arrange the trainings of non-professionals and untrained schools teachers in Regional Institute of Teachers Training (RITE).
6	As a large no of posts are still lying vacant in-spite of school / merit based recruitment. Hence efforts need to expedite the case.	Yes	20 Nil	The Education Department is trying level best to fill the vacant posts in Govt schools of District.

7	As the professional training is the essential element for improving the capacity building of the in service teachers hence department needs efforts to start training programs without further delay.	Yes	Nil	The Education Department is planning to arrange the trainings of non-professionals and untrained schools teachers in Regional Institute of Teachers Education (RITE).
8	As the most of the students unable to read and write the paragraphs included in syllabus hence department needs more monitoring and control.	Yes	Nil	The Education Department is trying level best to improve the quality of education in Govt schools of District D.I.Khan.
9	As the enrollment of students reduced in-spite of school / merit based recruitment hence department needs more monitoring and control.	Yes	Nil	The Education Department is trying level best to increase enrollment in Govt schools of District.
10	Setting of key performance indicators for teaching staff.	Yes	Nil	The department is agreed with the audit observation and working will be made on setting key performance indicator. However, without setting key performance indicators for newly appointed teachers the management remains unaware about performance of school teachers.
11	Implementation of rationalization policy while posting of teachers and action against the person(s) at fault.	Yes	Nil	The rationalization policy implemented partially and remaining schools will be implemented soon. Reply of the department was not convincing as due to non- implementation of rationalization policy in letter and spirit students were suffered.

ANNEXURES

Annex-1 Para No. 4.1.1

Detail Showing Illegal and irregular appointment of teachers

S #	Name of appointment	Cadre	Remarks
1	Rajab Naeem	CT	Post non-advertised through NTS
2	AsifaUmima	CT	Post non-advertised through NTS
3	Salma Bibi	Qaria	Fake score by neglecting merit candidate
4	Khadija Bibi	Qaria	Qaria post was not advertised through NTS
5	KalssomBibi	PET	Post non advertised through NTS
6	UmmakAyaz	PST	Post non advertised through NTS
7	Asia bibi	PST	Post non advertised through NTS
8	ZalekhaBibi	PST	Post non advertised through NTS
9	Afshan	PST	Post non advertised through NTS
10	Salma Jabeen	PST	Overage more than two years without giving age relaxation
11	MasoomaBushra	PST	05 posts were advertised while she was at sixthnoinmerit.
12	Samana Zahra	PST	Excess appointment than advertisement posts.
13	ZahidaGul	PST	Did not possess FA qualification.
14	Salma Atta	PST	Having no PTC course.
15	ShamshedBegum	PST	Overage by 8 years and 9 months
16	SabiaBibi	PST	She was not eligible in GGPS GaraMahmood
17	Qaboos Jamal	PST	She was not eligibleinGGPSMaskon
18	AminaBibi	PST	Low in the merit
19	ArshadLatif	PST	Low in the merit
20	Sidra Behram	PST	Post was not advertised through NTS
21	ShafaqZahoor	PST	Having no PTC course
22	IrfaNazish	PST	Not applied for schools GGPS MureedShah.

Annex-2
Para No. 4.3.1

Detail Showing Poor quality of education

S.No	Name of School	Urdu reading/ writing			English reading/ writing			Maths		
		A	B	C	A	B	C	A	B	C
1.	Govt Primary School No.1	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-
2.	Govt Primary School No.2	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-
3.	Govt Primary School No.3	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-
4.	Govt Primary School No.4	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-
5.	Govt Primary School No.5	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>		<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>
6.	Govt Primary School ShYousaf	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>
7.	Govt Primary School Dinpur	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>		<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-
8.	Govt Primary School Himat		-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>
9.	Govt Primary School Haji Mora	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>
10.	Govt Primary School Chah Malik	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>		-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-
11.	Govt Girls Primary School No.1	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>
12.	Govt Girls Primary School No.2	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-
13.	Govt Girls Primary School ShYosaf		<input type="checkbox"/>	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-
14.	Govt Girls Primary School Himat	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>
15.	Govt Girls Primary School Barababad	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>		-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>
16.	Govt Girls Primary School Khutti	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>		-	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-
17.	Govt Girls Primary School Ranazai	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-
18.	Govt Girls Primary School Dinpur	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-
19.	Govt Girls Primary School Mandi town	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>		<input type="checkbox"/>	-
20.	Govt Girls Primary School KachiPaid	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-	-	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	-	-

- A- Excellent
B- Good
C- poor

Annex-3
Para No. 4.3.2

Detail Showing Downfall in the student's enrollment ratio

S #	Year	Students enrolled (Male)	No of schools at all level (Male)	Ratio
1	2017	130,500	719	181
2	2018	131,300	974	134
3	2019	133,525	975	136

S #	Year	Students enrolled (Female)	No of schools at all level (Female)	Ratio
1	2017	79,953	598	133.7
2	2018	69,064	598	115.5
3	2019	78,553	607	129

Annex-4
Para No. 4.3.4

Detail showing non implementation of rationalization policy

Surplus teachers Girls Schools					
S.No	Name of School	Number of students	Available teachers	Required teachers	Surplus Teachers
1	GGPS Lunda	131	4	3	1
2	GGPSNaiwela	193	6	5	1
3	GGPSMahra	158	5	4	1
4	GGPSRorri	211	6	5	1
5	GGPS Kulachi-II	238	7	6	1
6	GGPSKokar	133	4	3	1
7	GGPSGarahEsa	98	3	2	1
8	GGPSJandar	39	2	1	1
9	GGPSAman Abad	62	3	2	1
10	GPS Gurrshadi	113	5	3	2
11	GPSOmeraywali	27	2	1	1
12	GPS Haji Mohra-II	171	6	4	2
13	GPSChah Malik	132	4	3	1
14	GPSBastiDarbar	84	3	2	1
15	GPSPotta	79	3	2	1
Total			63	46	17